The ICGA Clone and Derivative Investigation Panel

By David Levy

I am pleased to be able to announce the establishment of the ICGA Clone and Derivative Investigation Panel. The founding statutes of the panel are appended below. The Secretariat comprises Robert Hyatt, Mark Lefler and Harvey Williamson.

Those chess programmers and others who are interested in joining the panel may apply at www.icga.wikispaces.com We particularly urge all of you who have taken part in past ICGA (and ICCA) events to join the panel so as to give the benefit of your experience to the discussions that will take place there.

The first matter to be investigated by the panel will be the allegations that have been appearing on various web sites and forums, leading to my recent article “Attack of the Clones” that was published on www.chessvibes.com However, the brief of the panel is to examine all allegations of cloning and derivative program creation where a prima facie case has been made and brought to the panel’s attention. This can extend beyond chess, into the realm of the other games contested at the annual Computer Olympiads. In the case of games other than chess appropriate experts will be invited by the ICGA to join the panel.

ICGA Clone and Derivative Investigation Panel

Founding statutes: February 22nd 2011

1 Purpose

The purpose of the Panel shall be to:

[a] Investigate and discuss allegations of cloning or creating a derivative of strategy games programs;

[b] Report to the ICGA as to the veracity or otherwise of such allegations;

[c] Make recommendations to the ICGA as to what action if any should be taken against those found by the Panel to have been guilty of cloning or creating a derivative;

[d] Publish the findings of the Panel.

2 Membership
The Panel shall be open to:

[a] Programmers who have participated in any ICGA or ICCA World Championship for computer chess or in any Computer Olympiad or in any other computer competitions deemed appropriate by the ICGA.

[b] The office-bearers of the ICGA;

[c] Persons accepted as experts by the ICGA or by a unanimous decision of the Secretariat of the Panel.

Membership may be denied or rescinded to those deemed by the ICGA to have breached the normal ethical bounds expected of members.

Members may only participate under their own name. No anonymous membership or participation in discussions will be permitted.

There shall be no membership fees.

3 Operation of the Panel

[a] The Panel shall conduct its discussions on a Web site forum closed to non-members.

[b] All discussions on the Panel’s web site forum shall be in English.

[c] The Panel’s web site shall be operated and maintained by a person or persons invited by the ICGA to do so.

[d] The day-to-day activities of the Panel shall be managed by a Secretariat of three members of the Panel who shall be invited or approved by the ICGA. The ICGA shall have the right to replace members of the Secretariat at its sole discretion upon giving seven days notice on the forum.

[e] For all general decisions relating to the day-to-day running of the Panel and its forum a majority decision of the Secretariat shall suffice. In any matters deemed by the ICGA to be of an especially crucial or controversial nature the ICGA may overrule a decision of the Secretariat.

[f] Anyone against whom an allegation of cloning or creating a derivative has been made on the forum shall have the right to respond in the forum to each and every posting relating to such allegations, provided that such person is a current member of the forum. In the case of persons who have previously been barred from participating in the forum, for example persons previously found by the Panel to have been guilty of cloning, such persons shall be invited by the Secretariat to present their defence to the Panel as and when the Secretariat feels is appropriate.
The Secretariat shall normally decide when an allegation of cloning or creating a derivative program has been sufficiently investigated and discussed in the forum. At such time the Secretariat shall be responsible for presenting to the ICGA the Panel’s report on the allegations, and on the defence if any offered by those against whom the allegations have been made, and on the findings of the Panel as to the veracity or otherwise of the allegations. The Secretariat’s report to the ICGA shall include its recommendations if any as to what action if any should be taken by the ICGA in respect of sanctions against anyone found by the Panel to have been guilty of cloning or creating a derivative. Before making its decisions the ICGA shall invite the accused to present any comments they might have on the Panel’s findings and recommendations.

The ICGA shall consider the reports and recommendations of the Panel and shall at its sole discretion decide upon what action if any should be taken. The sanctions that the ICGA might take against those found guilty of cloning or creating a derivative include but are not limited to:

- Banning the guilty person(s) from participation in future ICGA events for any period deemed appropriate by the ICGA;
- Publicizing, wheresoever it deems appropriate, the allegations and the names of those who have been investigated by the Panel and the findings of the Panel;
- Recommending to other computer event organizers the exclusion of persons who have been found guilty by the Panel.
- Annulling any titles that have already been awarded to programs that have since found by the Panel to have been clones or derivative programs, and demanding the return of any prize money paid to the offending programmer(s).

4 General Matters

These statutes may be changed at any time by the ICGA at its sole discretion, upon the giving of 30 days notice in the forum.

The Panel shall be an advisory body of the ICGA. In all matters of dispute the decision of the ICGA shall be final.

* * * * * * *